

Workforce Race Equality Standard 2019

REPORTING TEMPLATE

| | | |
|---|----------------------------------|-------------|
| Name of organisation | Date of report: month | Year |
| Birmingham and Solihull Clinical Commissioning Group | August | 2019 |
| Name and title of Board lead for the Workforce Race Equality Standard | | |
| Paul Sherriff, Director of Organisational Development and Partnerships | | |
| Name and contact details of lead manager compiling this report | | |
| Michelle Dunne, Manager for Equality, Diversity and Inclusion, michelle.dunne1@nhs.net | | |
| Unique URL link on which this report will be found | | |
| https://www.birminghamandsolihullccg.nhs.uk/about-us/equality-and-diversity/nhs-equality-standards/nhs-workforce-race-equality-standard | | |
| This report has been signed off by on behalf of the Board (insert name and date) | | |
| Corporate Management Team, 23 August 2019 | | |

Report on the WRES indicators 2019

1. Background narrative

a. Any issues of completeness of data

Birmingham and Solihull CCG (BSol) was formed on 1 April 2018, as a result of a merger between the following CCGs – Birmingham CrossCity, Birmingham South Central and Solihull. This is the second WRES report from BSol (note the data for the 2018 report was as at 1 April 2018 rather than 31 March 2018, as this was when the CCG was created and staff records and data became available as a single organisation). As 2018 was the first year of operation data for Indicators 2, 3 and 4 were unavailable. We are unable to report with accuracy on Indicator 4 (access to non-mandatory training and CPD) as the systems and processes are still being developed to comprehensively record, collect, analyse and report on this area (see action plan).

b. Any matters relating to reliability of comparisons with previous years

Birmingham and Solihull CCG was created on 1 April 2018 and 2018/19 was the first year of operation, therefore comparative data for Indicators 2, 3 and 4 is unavailable.

2. Total numbers of staff

a. Employed within this organisation at the date of the report

324

b. Proportion of BME staff employed within this organisation at the date of the report

29.3%

Report on the WRES indicators 2019, continued

3. Self-reporting

a. The proportion of total staff who have self-reported their ethnicity

91%

b. Have any steps been taken in the last reporting period to improve the level of self-reporting by ethnicity?

Work has been undertaken to improve self-reporting of all protected characteristics at Governing Body level with one to one support and assistance provided to encourage updating of personal records on ESR.

c. Are any steps planned during the current reporting period to improve the level of self-reporting by ethnicity?

Yes – it has been identified that particular cohorts of staff (mainly those working on a 'sessional' basis, engaged on a contract for services basis) are less likely to have up-to-date information relating to their protected characteristics on their ESR record. This will be addressed through the Workforce and Organisational Development Group (see action plan).

4. Workforce data

a. What period does the organisation's workforce data refer to?

Indicator 1 – as at 31 March 2019
Indicators 2 and 3 – between 1 April 2018 and 31 March 2019
Indicator 9 – as at 31 March 2019

Report on the WRES indicators 2019, continued

5. Workforce Race Equality Indicators

Indicator 1

Percentage of staff in each of the AfC Bands 1-9 and VSM (including executive Board members) compared with the percentage of staff in the overall workforce. Organisations should undertake this calculation separately for non-clinical and for clinical staff.

Data for reporting year 2019

| Pay Band | BAME | WHITE | UNKNOWN | No. of Staff in CCG |
|---|--------------|--------------|-----------|--------------------------------|
| 3 | 33% | 50% | 17% | ** |
| 4 | 37% | 63% | 0% | 27 |
| 5 | 32% | 68% | 0% | 34 |
| 6 | 40% | 60% | 0% | 20 |
| 7 | 41% | 55% | 5% | 44 |
| 8A | 33% | 65% | 1% | 79 |
| 8B | 29% | 71% | 0% | 38 |
| 8C | 6% | 88% | 6% | 16 |
| 8D | 0% | 79% | 21% | 14 |
| 9 | 17% | 83% | 0% | ** |
| Other | 22% | 38% | 40% | 50 |
| % of staff in whole organisation | 29.3% | 61.7% | 9% | Total No. of Staff: 324 |

Data for previous year 2018

| Pay Band | BAME | WHITE | UNKNOWN | No. of Staff in CCG |
|----------------------------------|--------------|--------------|-------------|--------------------------------|
| 3 | 0% | 100% | 0% | ** |
| 4 | 24% | 71% | 5% | 21 |
| 5 | 40% | 60% | 0% | 30 |
| 6 | 25% | 65% | 10% | 20 |
| 7 | 43% | 54% | 3% | 46 |
| 8A | 34% | 63% | 3% | 67 |
| 8B | 30% | 70% | 0% | 47 |
| 8C | 0% | 94% | 6% | 16 |
| 8D | 8% | 77% | 15% | 13 |
| 9 | 0% | 100% | 0% | ** |
| Other | 28.13% | 37.5% | 34.37% | 32 |
| % of staff in whole organisation | 29.9% | 63.4% | 6.7% | Total No. of Staff: 298 |

Narrative and analysis

** - where there are less than 10 staff in post the figures have not been published to avoid identification.

- Advice was sought from the National WRES team regarding the need to split clinical and non-clinical posts; we were advised to report the workforce data without splitting into the two categories as whilst there are clinical staff in post, they are not performing a clinical role for the CCG.
- Pay bands 8C to 9 and Other (which includes posts such as Lay Advisors, Directors, Clinical Leads and Independent Members) are all under-represented when compared to the BAME representation of the workforce as a whole.
- White staff are under-represented in pay bands 3, 7 and Other.
- Ethnic Origin 'Unknown' is high in pay bands 6, 8D and Other.
- Overall, when comparing the two years results there has been a slight decrease in the percentage of BAME staff (from 29.9% to 29.3%) and also White staff (rom 63.4% to 61.7%) and increase in the Unknown category (from 6.7% to 9%).

Action taken since previous report and action planned

In July 2019 a management and leadership development programme delivered by WM Leadership Academy and Health Education England was launched to CCG staff. Initially two cohorts (20 staff per cohort) will complete the **Forward Thinking Leadership** programme which is running between September and February for cohort 1 and January to June for cohort 2. The programme is a practical approach to development which explores individual, team and organisational values and behaviours; Participants will gain a deeper understanding of themselves, their impact on others, tools to engage individuals and teams through a coaching approach, how to give effective feedback in four simple steps, how to identify and nurture individuals, tools to develop succession plans and techniques to support improvement and change plus much more. To ensure sustainability and enable wider participation in the programme, five staff will be trained to deliver the programme in-house.

A **deep-dive into recruitment activity** is being undertaken; in-depth analysis has been carried out at a Directorate level to understand by pay band and protected characteristics the profile of staff as this will enable the CCG to identify potential areas for positive action initiatives.

Improve equality data disclosure through articles in the staff newsletter which communicate the purpose for collating the data and the benefits for staff and the organisation – encouraging staff to update their personal profile on ESR.

Indicator 2

Relative likelihood of BME staff being appointed from shortlisting compared to that of White staff being appointed from shortlisting across all posts.

Data for reporting year 2019

| | WHITE | BAME | UNKNOWN |
|-------------|-------|------|---------|
| SHORTLISTED | 374 | 369 | 28 |
| APPOINTED | 38 | 30 | 0 |

Data for previous year 2018

Unavailable as a new organisation.

Narrative and analysis

White applicants are 1.25 times more likely to be appointed than BAME applicants.

Action taken since previous report and action planned

A **deep-dive into recruitment activity** is being undertaken; in-depth analysis has been carried out at a Directorate level to understand by pay band and protected characteristics the profile of staff this will enable the CCG to identify potential areas for positive action initiatives. Other initiatives being explored, include reviewing the composition of interview panels to be more diverse and representative, recruitment and selection refresher training, end to end recruitment process review to integrate CCG values and inclusion and surveying applicants to gain feedback on the process.

Indicator 3

Relative likelihood of BME staff entering the formal disciplinary process, compared to that of White staff entering the formal disciplinary process, as measured by entry into a formal disciplinary investigation*

*Note: indicator based on data from a two year rolling average of the current year and the previous year

Data for reporting year 2019

Number of staff entering the formal disciplinary process since 1 April 2018 = 0

Data for previous year 2018

Unavailable as a new organisation.

Narrative and analysis

No staff have entered the formal disciplinary process since BSol CCG came into effect.

Action taken since previous report and action planned

The CCG has a disciplinary policy in place which details the process and procedures for staff and managers to follow. The monthly management information provided to the Workforce and OD Group enables tracking of any employee relations issues. No specific actions planned currently.

Indicator 4

Relative likelihood of BME staff accessing non-mandatory training and CPD compared to White staff.

Data for reporting year 2019

Unavailable

Data for previous year 2018

Unavailable as a new organisation.

Narrative and analysis

Currently staff who access any non-mandatory training or CPD can update their personal records on ESR; despite this, actual inputting of the information is patchy, with most staff not updating their records so any data extraction is incomplete and unreliable.

Action taken since previous report and action planned

Human Resources has undertaken an exercise asking all staff to provide their learning for the previous 12 months including learning such as shadowing. This is currently being processed and results will be communicated to the Workforce and Organisational Development Group. The Workforce and Organisational Development Group will be addressing this outstanding

issue; systems and process will be put in place to enable reporting of the numbers of staff who access non-mandatory training in future WRES reports.

All CCG staff will be participating in an organisational development programme called **Owning and Driving Performance** which provides an equal focus on what we do (priority setting, planning, delivery and monitoring) and how we do it (values and behaviours, skills and knowledge). This programme will be completed between October and December 2019 and is linked into the appraisal and objective setting process.

Indicator 5

Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from patients, relatives or the public in the last 12 months.

Data for reporting year 2019

| | |
|-------|-------|
| WHITE | 10.5% |
| BAME | 8.3% |

Data for previous year 2018

| | |
|-------|--------|
| WHITE | 17.2% |
| BAME | 31.25% |

Narrative and analysis

The CCG does not participate in the national NHS Staff Survey but conducted its own staff survey which included the relevant WRES questions. All staff were invited to participate in the survey which was undertaken in January 2019.

Over 90% of the staff who answered this question stated that they had not experienced this treatment from patients, service users or the public in the past year, which is an improvement from the 2018 survey when the figure was 80.8%.

Both of the BAME staff who had experienced this behaviour said it had happened between 1 and 2 times in the past year; of the 10 white staff who had been subject to this treatment, seven said it had occurred 1 to 2 times, two staff experienced this 3 to 5 times and one member of staff experienced it 6 to 10 times.

There has been a significant reduction in the percentage of both white and BAME staff experiencing this treatment when compared to the results for 2018.

The median benchmark for CCG's reported through the NHS Staff Survey Results for 2018 (published February 2019) show that nationally 9.48% white and 6.67% BAME staff indicate experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse at work from patients, service users or the public in the past 12 months. BSol's figures are marginally higher than the national median score.

Action taken since previous report and action planned

Feedback was given to all staff via emails, staff newsletter and team briefs on the outcome of the staff survey. Harassment and Bullying workshops were held, open to all staff, to explore the issues in more depth and determine the next steps to be taken by the CCG. A further flash staff survey will be undertaken during October 2019.

Indicator 6

Percentage of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from staff in last 12 months.

Data for reporting year 2019

| | |
|--------------|-------|
| WHITE | 22.5% |
| BAME | 19.2% |

Data for previous year 2018

| | |
|-------|--------|
| WHITE | 18.98% |
| BAME | 21.87% |

Narrative and analysis

76.4% of all survey respondents stated that they had not experienced harassment, bullying or abuse from staff in the last 12 months this result is similar to the previous results for 2018 which was 76.8%.

Of the five BAME staff who had experienced this behaviour, four said it had happened between 1 and 2 times and one said it had happened between 3 and 5 times in the past year.

For White staff, 14 had experienced this 1 to 2 times; 2 had experienced it 6 to 10 times and 2 more than ten times in the past year.

The median benchmark for CCG's reported through the NHS Staff Survey Results for 2018 (published February 2019) show that nationally 17.86% white and 31.25% BAME staff indicate experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse at work from staff in the past 12 months. BSol's figures are lower (better) than the national median score.

Action taken since previous report and action planned

Feedback was given to all staff via emails, staff newsletter and team briefs on the outcome of the survey; the email summarising the results included the following statement "The CCG are committed to creating a safe working environment, free from bullying and harassment, where staff are treated with dignity and respect. This behaviour will not be tolerated in any form. You are reminded that if they are experiencing this behaviour at work, they can raise with HR in the strictest of confidence, their line manager (or another appropriate manager) if they are able to, or their Trade Union representative. Issues raised will be investigated as a matter of high priority. The CCG bullying and harassment policy is attached."

Harassment and Bullying workshops were held, open to all staff, to explore the issues in more depth and determine the next steps to be taken by the CCG.

Indicator 7

Percentage believing that organisation provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion.

Data for reporting year 2019

| | |
|-------|-------|
| WHITE | 52.4% |
| BAME | 46.2% |

Data for previous year 2018

| | |
|-------|--------|
| WHITE | 56.96% |
| BAME | 28.12% |

Narrative and analysis

Overall, 46.1% of the survey respondents agree that the CCG acts fairly with regard to career progression and promotion. 19.2% disagreed and 34.7% didn't know.

The results for White staff have deteriorated since the previous staff survey (reducing from 56.96% to 52.4%) but have improved for BAME staff (increasing from 28.12% to 46.2%).

The median benchmark for CCG's reported through the NHS Staff Survey Results for 2018 (published February 2019) show that nationally 87.33% white and 60% BAME staff indicate that staff believe their organisation provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion. BSol's figures are lower (worse) than the national median score.

Action taken since previous report and action planned

In July 2019 a management and leadership development programme delivered by WM Leadership Academy and Health Education England was launched to CCG staff. Initially two cohorts (20 staff per cohort) will complete the **Forward Thinking Leadership** programme which is running between September and February for cohort 1 and January to June for cohort 2. The programme is a practical approach to development which explores individual, team and organisational values and behaviours; Participants will gain a deeper understanding of themselves, their impact on others, tools to engage individuals and teams through a coaching approach, how to give effective feedback in four simple steps, how to identify and nurture individuals, tools to develop succession plans and techniques to support improvement and change plus much more. To ensure sustainability and enable wider participation in the programme, five staff will be trained to deliver the programme in-house.

Indicator 8

In the last 12 months have you personally experienced discrimination at work from any of the following?

b) Manager/team leader or other colleagues

Data for reporting year 2019

| | |
|-------|------|
| WHITE | 8.8% |
| BAME | 4% |

Data for previous year 2018

| | |
|-------|-------|
| WHITE | 10.1% |
| BAME | 15.6% |

Narrative and analysis

Significant improvements are shown in the results for BAME staff reducing from 15.6% in 2018 to 4% in 2019. Results for White staff are also showing an improvement, with a smaller reduction from 10.1% to 8.8%.

Over 91% of survey respondents had not experienced discrimination whilst at work (improving on last year's figure of 85.6%).

Overall, 8.5% of all staff stated that they had personally experienced discrimination at work from their manager, team leader or colleague, an improvement on the previous year's figure of 14.4%.

10.8% of those who 'preferred not to say' about their ethnic origin indicated that they had experienced this type of discrimination in the workplace (a reduction from 35.7% in the previous year).

The median benchmark for CCG's reported through the NHS Staff Survey Results for 2018 (published February 2019) show that nationally 4.72% white and 15% BAME staff indicate that they have personally experienced discrimination at work from their manager/team leader or other colleagues. BSol's figures are higher (worse) than the national median score for White staff and lower (better) than the national median score for BAME staff.

Action taken since previous report and action planned

In July 2019 a management and leadership development programme delivered by WM Leadership Academy and Health Education England was launched to CCG staff. Initially two cohorts (20 staff per cohort) will complete the **Forward Thinking Leadership** programme which is running between September and February for cohort 1 and January to June for cohort 2. The programme is a practical approach to development which explores individual, team and organisational values and behaviours; Participants will gain a deeper understanding of themselves, their impact on others, tools to engage individuals and teams through a coaching approach, how to give effective feedback in four simple steps, how to identify and nurture individuals, tools to develop succession plans and techniques to support improvement and change plus much more. To ensure sustainability and enable wider participation in the programme, five staff will be trained to deliver the programme in-house.

Indicator 9

Percentage difference between the organisations' Board voting membership and its overall workforce.

Data for reporting year 2019

| 2019 | White | BAME | Unknown |
|-----------------------------|--------|--------|---------|
| Overall GB Membership | 50% | 7.7% | 42.3% |
| Overall Workforce | 61.7% | 29.6% | 9% |
| Difference | -11.7% | -21.6% | 33.3% |
| Voting GB Membership | | | |
| Voting GB Membership | 44.4% | 11.1% | 44.4% |
| Overall Workforce | 61.7% | 29.6% | 9% |
| Difference | -17.3% | -18.5% | 35.4% |
| Executive Membership | | | |
| Executive Membership | 100% | 0% | 0% |
| Overall Workforce | 61.7% | 29.6% | 9% |
| Difference | 38.3% | -29.6% | -9% |

Data for previous year 2018

| | WHITE | BAME | UNKNOWN |
|-------------------|---------|---------|---------|
| GOVERNING BODY | 44.44% | 11.11% | 44.44% |
| OVERALL WORKFORCE | 63.4% | 29.9% | 6.7% |
| % DIFFERENCE | -18.96% | -18.79% | 37.74% |

Narrative and analysis

In terms of the overall Governing Body membership:

- 26 members in total; there are 18 members with voting rights and 6 without;
- The ethnic origin is Unknown for over 42% of the Governing Body (11 members in total); this is significantly higher than the workforce as a whole (9%);
- 100% of the executive members have a recorded ethnic origin as White compared to 61.7% for the whole workforce; this is an under-representation by 38.3% for White and 29.6% for BAME ethnic origins;
- Voting members are under representative (when compared to the overall workforce) for both White and BAME and over-representative in the Unknown category;
- Unable to accurately compare the current results with the previous year as the method for calculating and reporting on this indicator has changed.

Action taken since previous report and action planned

Work was undertaken to improve reporting against ethnic origin and reduce the number of Unknowns, however this resulted in limited success. There will be a concerted focus in the coming months to improve reporting; this will include identification and addressing any access issues to ESR and we will work with Governing Body members to identify a suitable method for updating their records.

6. Are there any other factors or data which should be taken into consideration in assessing progress?

N/A

7. Organisations should produce a detailed WRES Action Plan, agreed by its Board.

A Workforce Inclusion Action Plan is being agreed through the Workforce and Organisational Development Group (Chaired by the Director of Organisational Development and Partnerships) which will encompass the WRES actions arising from this year's results.

Workforce Race Equality Standard 2019/20 Action Plan - Overview

| No. | Headline Action | Completion Date | Lead | Link to WRES indicator |
|-----|--|------------------------------------|--|------------------------|
| 1 | Equality Monitoring Data refresh to reduce the number of Unknowns* | December 2019 | Workforce and Organisational Development Group | Indicators 1 and 9 |
| 2 | Implement system to capture Non-Mandatory training | December 2019 | Workforce and Organisational Development Group | Indicator 4 |
| 3 | Undertake Recruitment deep-dive* | September 2019 | Workforce and Organisational Development Group | Indicators 1 and 2 |
| 4 | Implement Forward Thinking Leadership training* | Implementation from September 2019 | Workforce and Organisational Development Group | Indicators 1, 7 and 8 |
| 5 | Implement Owning and Driving Performance training programme. | Implementation by October 2019 | Workforce and Organisational Development Group | Indicator 4 |

*Note – these actions are fully detailed with measures, outcomes and detailed activities in the Workforce Inclusion Action Plan, overseen by the Workforce and Organisational Development Group.